

Source: News Center Maine





Economic and Political Drivers of COVID-19 Policy in 2020

Brandon Lieberthal Allison Gardner Sandra De Urioste-Stone











Research Objectives

- 1 What were the main motivators of COVID-19 mitigation policy in 2020?
- 2 How did differences in public attitude contribute to the severity of the epidemic?
- **3** How can we quantify and answer these questions scientifically?





Shelter-in-place Orders



(Lockdown Duration) ~ (% GDP Tourism) + (Trump Support)

R² = 0.34, F = 9.74, df = 2,38, p < 0.001 Other tested factors: population density, urbanicity, income, education, climate, latitude and longitude





Hypotheses

- In March 2020, COVID-19 was most severe in counties with high population density and high rates of travel
- From April onward, COVID-19 was most severe in counties with high economic dependence on tourism and low economic and political motivation
- Social distancing more effective in urban than rural counties

Statistical Test

- At each week of 2020, test relationship between disease reproduction rate and socioeconomic predictors
- Filter out effects of climate, population density, etc.





COVID-19 Cases Over Time



Doesn't tell us a whole lot





More Interesting: R_t

- R₀: pure reproduction number
 - ~2.5 for original COVID-19, 5 for Delta variant, 8 for Omicron variant
- R_t: actual reproduction number based on human behavior and mitigation efforts
 - Typically between 0 and 3
- Goal: compute evolution of R_t for each county since beginning of pandemic
- Compare R_t to demographics and policy choices





Step 1: Clean the data



- Smooth the data over one-week blocks
- Adjust for testing delays





Step 2: Post-hoc Analysis of R_t

- Assume infection rate λ follows a Poisson distribution: $L(\lambda|k) = \frac{\lambda^k e^{-\lambda}}{k!}$
- What value of R_t most correctly predicts number of cases over next two weeks?







Map of counties with $R_t > 1$: March 15 vs. June 15







R_t: Rural vs. Urban







Student's t-test

• Each week of 2020, run a statistical model:

 $R_t = (ruralness) + (\% GDP \ tourism) + (net \ Trump \ support)$

- Other predictor variables: population density, income, education, religion, health care access, temperature, precipitation, and lockdown status
- A "Student's t-test" score is a nondimensional measure of correlation between a predictor variable and the R_t value for a given week
- If the score is above of a certain threshold, then there is a meaningful correlation between the predictor and R_t











Conclusions

- Outbreak events and human behavior are interrelated
- During early outbreak, population density and urbanicity were strongest predictors of COVID risk
- Economic and political considerations outweighed human case data in policy decisions
- Over summer and fall, counties with apparent economic or political incentives to ignore the pandemic suffered from more severe and frequent COVID outbreaks



Focus on Maine

- Maine is divided into eight "tourism regions" and sixteen counties
- Tourism comprises 6.4% of Maine's GDP
- Nonessential businesses were closed from April 2 to May 31
- Cruise traffic was closed from April 8 to July 1









Businesses StatisticalseGonshelationsrTest (Maine)







Conclusions

- During initial business closure, COVID-19 spread faster in urban counties like Cumberland and Androscoggin
- When businesses reopened, counties with high Trump support took fewer precautions and were more infectious
- When tourism resumed, counties with high economic dependence on tourism had highest R_t values
- At the end of tourism season, no significant difference in R_t between counties





Acknowledgements

Collaborators

Sandra De Urioste-Stone, University of Maine Allison Gardner, University of Maine Brian Allan, University of Illinois Andrew Mackay, University of Illinois Aiman Soliman, University of Illinois Shaowen Wang, University of Illinois <u>Students</u>

Cole Butler, Undergraduate Zoey Zuo, Undergraduate



