Search Committee Briefing: Implicit Bias, Diversity, and Inclusive Hiring Practices

Amie Parker, Director
Office of Equal Opportunity
University of Maine System
amie.parker@maine.edu
207.592.3618

Objectives

• Discuss commitment to developing a diverse team and inclusive environment
• Understand bias obstacles inherent in social selection situations
• Discuss best practices for maximizing inclusion and minimizing bias
• Review what it means for your search

Nondiscrimination Statement

The University of Maine System does not discriminate on the grounds of:

• race
• color
• religion
• sex
• sexual orientation
• transgender status
• gender expression

• national origin
• citizenship status
• age
• disability
• genetic information or
• veteran’s status

Source: Board of Trustees Policy 401
Equal Employment Opportunity & Affirmative Action

- Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO)
  - Prohibits discrimination based on protected groups
- Affirmative Action (AA)
  - Additional proactive measures to help ensure equal employment opportunities
  - Good faith efforts to diversity our workforce

Affirmative Action

As an Affirmative Action employer, we commit to:
- Engage in purposeful workforce planning
- Engage in practices that create and demonstrate our priorities
- Annually establishes goals when number of underrepresented groups are lower than the availability in the labor market

Affirmative Action

- Not rigid, not quotas
- Good faith effort
- Federal law prohibits preferential selection based on gender or race
- Our current plan identifies gaps in employment of gender, race, disability and veteran status in various departments/job categories
Implementation

- Invitation to applicants to self-identify when they apply for a position
- EO collects data regarding composition of the applicant pool
- HR Partner can consult and share information about any gaps in recruitment goals vs. actual candidate data in general terms

Implementation Strategies

- Faculty and staff on search committees can/should call potential candidates and encourage them to apply
- What does your network look like?
- Appoint search committees that reflect gender, racial, and other types of diversity
- Articulate an individual’s value to the committee; avoid tokenism
- Send announcements to HBCUs and other institutions that have a strong history of serving historically underrepresented groups
- Contact individuals who have received significant grants or professional recognition and ask for names of promising diverse scholars
Ways to Actively Recruit: Generating a Pool vs. Tapping a Pool

- Create a standing committee that identifies women or diverse candidates
- Promote Maine and the university at every opportunity
- Pre-hire connections/relationships = better retention
- Speak with recent hires and see how they were successfully recruited
- Keep a candidate file for future or anticipated openings

Diversity = the presence of difference

The Importance of Being Authentic
Diversity Iceberg

Inclusion

An inclusive institution:

• Involves and empowers its members
• Recognizes the inherent worth of all
• Values and practices respect for the talents, beliefs, backgrounds and ways of living of its members
• Promotes and sustains a sense of belonging

What factors create an inclusive environment?

• Everyone is treated with respect and dignity—everyone is valued
• Policies regarding equity are in place
• Faculty and staff are representative of local community and welcoming of underrepresented groups
• Institution values inclusion
  • Inclusion is supported and demonstrated by senior administration
  • Institutional barriers to inclusion are identified and dismantled
  • Unnecessary hierarchies are discouraged
Why is diversity important?

• Changes in enrollment
• Leads to higher retention rates for faculty, staff and students
• Preparing our students for success in the international world and global economy by developing cultural competence
• Diverse working groups are more productive, creative, and innovative (Herring, 2009)
• Level of critical analysis of decisions and alternatives is higher in groups exposed to minority viewpoints (Ciment et al., 2004; Antonio et al., 2004)
• Groups of diverse problem solvers outperform groups of high-ability problem solvers (Fong; & Page, 2004, PNAS).

What is implicit bias?

Implicit bias refers to the attitudes or stereotypes that affect our understanding, actions, and decisions in an unconscious manner.

These biases, which encompass both favorable and unfavorable assessments, are activated involuntarily and without an individual’s awareness or intentional control.
Characteristics of Implicit Bias

- Implicit biases are pervasive and robust (Nosek, Smith et al., 2007)
- Everyone processes them, even people who swear to impartiality (Bachrach, Johnson, Wistrich, & Guthrie, 2009)
- Biases do not necessarily align with our declared beliefs or even reflect stances that we would endorse (Graham & Lowery, 2004; Greenwald & Krieon, 2006; Kang et al., 2012)

Implicit Bias & Identical Resumes

(Tilcsik, 2011)

Individuals who “whiten” resumes get more interviews and are more than twice as likely to get callbacks than candidates that reveal their race (Kang, DeCelles, Tilcsik, & Jun, 2016).

Employer callbacks for resumes that were whitened were much better in the application pile than those that included ethnic information, even though the qualifications listed were identical.

Employers claiming to be pro-diversity discriminated against resumes with racial references just as much as employers who didn’t mention diversity at all in their job ads.
Implicit Bias

Female applicants perceived as mothers were judged significantly less competent and committed, worthy of 7% less starting salary, and were held to more stringent hiring standards, e.g. higher test scores.

Source: Correll, Bernard, Paik (2007), Am J Sociology

Interviewers' verbal and nonverbal actions may affect the performance of interviewees.

What does your environment say about your department, division or campus?

Status Quo Bias

The April 2016 Harvard Business Review featured a study of a university's hiring decisions that concluded that where an applicant is the only woman in a pool of finalists, the odds of her being hired were "statistically zero." (Johnson, Helman & Chan, 2016)

This was consistent regardless of the size of the finalist pool and excluded all searches where there were no women or "minority" applicants.
Why does being the only woman in a pool of finalists matter?
It highlights how different she is from the norm.
Deviating from the norm can be risky for decision makers, as people tend to ostracize people who are different from the group.
Having your differences made salient can also lead to inferences of incompetence.

The Relationship Between Finalist Pools and Actual Hiring Decisions
According to one study of 20 finalists for university teaching positions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Composition of Finalist Pools</th>
<th>Likelihood of Hiring a Woman</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Only Woman</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Only Man</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Both Women</td>
<td>67%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When there were two “minorities” or women in the pool of finalists, the status quo changes, resulting in a significantly increased chance that a “minority” or woman would be hired.

- The odds of hiring a woman were 79.14 greater if there were at least two women in the finalist pool.
- The odds of hiring a “minority” were 193.72 greater if there were at least two “minority” candidates.

Implicit & Status Quo Bias

- Implicit biases are malleable and can be changed and replaced with new mental associations (Blair, 2002; Blair, Ma, & Lenton, 2002; Dasgupta, 2013).
- Seek out information on implicit bias (https://implicit.harvard.edu/implicit).
- “I don’t see color.” Identify and consciously acknowledge real group and individual differences.
- Routinely check thought processes and decisions for bias.

Combating Bias
Combating Bias

• Review applications individually - avoid reviewing as a committee as a whole
• Review materials when you are not overly tired or feeling rushed
• Focus on job-related criteria - tendency for bias decreases as more job relevant information is provided

Practical Tips and Strategies

Search Committee Responsibilities

• Select job posting locations that maximize outreach to qualified diverse populations
• Make transparent and remind ourselves of natural inclination toward implicit bias
• Be conscious of status quo bias
• Apply evaluation criteria consistently
• Conduct reference checks consistently
• Avoid social media exploration of candidate
• Document all decisions and the job-related reasons for them
### Topic Issues

- Questions that can/cannot be asked
- [http://www.maine.gov/mhr/hrc/guides/employment/pre-employment](http://www.maine.gov/mhr/hrc/guides/employment/pre-employment)
- Important that search committee as well as others who may interact with candidates are familiar with guidelines.

### Maine Human Rights Commission

#### Pre-Employment Inquiry Guide

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Age</strong></th>
<th>Questions about date of birth or other inquiries about age.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sex/Pregnancy</strong></td>
<td>Whether applicant has a spouse/significant other/partner that works for the employer. Questions asked only of one sex but not of the other, e.g., asking only women about childcare.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Religion</strong></td>
<td>Whether applicant is able to perform the essential functions of the job, including attendance requirements, if provided with reasonable accommodations for religious reasons.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Race</strong></td>
<td>Whether applicant has a spouse/significant other/partner that works for the employer.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Religious Affiliation</strong></td>
<td>Whether applicant has a spouse/significant other/partner that works for the employer.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Education</strong></td>
<td>Whether applicant has or has had any physical or mental impairments, disabilities, or health conditions. For food handling positions, whether applicant has a listed infectious or communicable disease that is transmissible to others through the handling of food.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Disability</strong></td>
<td>Whether applicant has or has had an alcohol or drug addiction problem.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Nationality, Lineage, Ancestry, Descent, Birthplace</strong></td>
<td>Whether applicant has a spouse/significant other/partner that works for the employer.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Language</strong></td>
<td>Whether applicant has a spouse/significant other/partner that works for the employer.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Marital Status</strong></td>
<td>Whether applicant has a spouse/significant other/partner that works for the employer.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Health</strong></td>
<td>Whether applicant has or has had an alcohol or drug addiction problem.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Religious Denomination, Affiliation, Functions of the Job</strong></td>
<td>Whether applicant has a spouse/significant other/partner that works for the employer.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Religious Affiliation of Educational Institutions</strong></td>
<td>Whether applicant has a spouse/significant other/partner that works for the employer.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Complexion or Color of Skin or Eyes</strong></td>
<td>Whether applicant has a spouse/significant other/partner that works for the employer.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Communication</strong></td>
<td>Whether applicant has a spouse/significant other/partner that works for the employer.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Physical or Mental Impairment, Disabilities, Health Condition</strong></td>
<td>Whether applicant has a spouse/significant other/partner that works for the employer.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Alcohol, Drug Addiction Problem</strong></td>
<td>Whether applicant has a spouse/significant other/partner that works for the employer.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Relationship Between Household Members</strong></td>
<td>Whether applicant has a spouse/significant other/partner that works for the employer.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sexual Orientation, Gender Identity, or Gender Expression</strong></td>
<td>Whether applicant has a spouse/significant other/partner that works for the employer.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Parent, Guardian, or Significant Other</strong></td>
<td>Whether applicant has a spouse/significant other/partner that works for the employer.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What if the candidate raises the topic?

Applicants may raise topics that are not appropriate:

- Example: Applicant starts talking about being an athlete or about issues related to the candidate's health.
- Suggest a redirecting of the conversation:
  - "I'm really interested in learning more about...
  - "Let's talk some more about...

Documentation

- HR will advise you about documentation required during the search process.
- Record any questions that arise at any time about eligibility, role, intent, non-discriminatory reasons for actions.
- Unrelated comments cannot be maintained for three years - search chair's responsibility.
- Email exchanges are also part of the search file and must be maintained.
- Committee notes should document why an applicant did or did not meet the criteria for the position.

REMINDER: It's not the candidate who gets the job who challenges the search.

Interview Notes

- Doodling notes and/or snide comments made during any portion of the search become part of the official file and are discoverable.
  - Examples: Looking to retire, short, husky, bald, tall, elite, blue-eyes, or the "Seven Dwarfs!
- Certain comments can lead a reviewer to wrong impressions of the process.
  - Example: "Butter Andy"
- Consider: "English is their second language, or had heavy accent"
  - Alternative: "Applicant's oral communication skills were weak and they had difficulty understanding questions."
Reference Checks

- May raise prohibited topics.
- Potential to obtain information that is not relevant to the position should NOT be shared.
- Important to know if there is anyone that the applicant does not want you to speak with.
- Social media/Google may inadvertently obtain information that is not relevant to the review.

Disability/Accommodation Questions

- Candidature with disability and you are not sure if they will request an accommodation - don’t ask
- If a candidate discloses a disability or requests an accommodation, the position will be modified to accommodate the individual. The Office of Equal Opportunity is to be contacted immediately.

Advisement: Amanda Paradis, amanda.paradis1@maine.edu, 207-581-1227

Accommodations should never be part of the negotiation process. Any accommodation will be addressed at handoff of the offer.

Resources

- Your campus HR Partner
- Office of Equal Opportunity, 207.581.1226 or equal.opportunity@maine.edu
- Additional resources provided through the Rising Tide Center legacy page: https://umaine.edu/risingtide under ‘Resources’ menu
Amie Parker, Director Office of Equal Opportunity
University of Maine System
amie.parker@maine.edu
207.592.3618

ANY QUESTIONS